



**CITY OF PROVIDENCE**  
**HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION**  
**MINUTES • JULY 25, 2016**

**Regular Meeting**

**444 Westminster St., 1st Fl., Conf. Room**

**4:45 PM**

Joseph A. Doorley, Jr. Municipal Building, Providence, RI 02903

**OPENING SESSION**

PRESENT: Marino, deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel, Parrillo, Martin  
ABSENT: Ryan, Fontecchio, Wilson-Barnes  
Staff Present: Jason Martin

**MINUTES**

Approval of June 27, 2016 Historic District Commission Regular Meeting Minutes

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>APPROVED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Clark Schoettle, Regular Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Catherine Lund, Regular Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Marino, deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel

**PROJECT REVIEW**

- CASE 16.084, 20 BAINBRIDGE AVENUE, George E. Boyden House, 1882 (BROADWAY)**  
The applicant is requesting the removal of 4 existing 2/2, double-hung wood windows and the installation of insulated 2/2 Renewal by Anderson replacement windows, third floor, rear elevation, and the replacement of two grouped awning windows on the first floor, north elevation.

**This item was continued at the request of the applicant.**

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>CONTINUED [UNANIMOUS]</b>	<b>Next: 8/22/2016 4:45 PM</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Cornelis deBoer, Regular Member	
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Kristi Agniel, Regular Member	
<b>AYES:</b>	Marino, deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel	

- CASE 16.069, 34 BENEFIT STREET, Mrs. Mary M. Gorham House, 1863-5 (COLLEGE HILL)**  
The applicant is requesting the installation of insulated replacement windows, all floors, all elevations.

Mark Rapp, architect, representing the owner, appeared before the Commission requesting the removal of the existing single-pane, double-hung wood windows and the installation of Trimline insulated, double-hung composite windows.

Mr. Martin gave a staff report. 34 Benefit Street is a structure of historical and architectural

**Historic District Commission**  
**444 Westminster Street, Ste 3A , Providence, RI 02903**  
**Phone 401 680 8400 | Fax 401 680 8492**

significance that contribute to the significance of the College Hill local historic district. At the June 27th meeting the Commission had requested that a window survey and existing conditions of the windows. That documentation has been provided to the Commission. Mr. Rapp gave an overview of the project. Surveyed 86 windows in various condition, approximately half appear serviceable/restorable. Two vinyl replacement windows in side porch, statement from Commission that those windows should be restored with diamond detail included as per other windows in side porch.

The Commission had the following comments: There was a discussion regarding wholesale replacement: the survey implies that a significant number of the windows appear salvageable. Commission suggests an estimate from a window restoration specialist to determine exactly which windows are salvageable and which windows need to be replaced is appropriate to make a determination as to the appropriateness of the application.

The Chair asked for public comment. The following public comment was taken:

- Marena Wisniewski, Providence Preservation Society, read a letter from the Preservation Society that was not in favor of replacing the windows at the property;
- Bill Deveney, 52 Benefit Street, agreed with the comments in PPS' letter; if some of the windows are still viable, should be reused;
- Wendy Markus, 33 Benefit Street, agreed with the comments in PPS' letter; was there any pictorial evidence of the building? and,
- Janet Drew, 81 Benefit Street, agreed with the comments in PPS' letter; was opposed to replacement.

Public comment was closed.

Motion to continue to a subsequent meeting with the applicant to return with an estimate from a window restoration specialist to determine exactly which windows are salvageable and which windows need to be replaced.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>CONTINUED [UNANIMOUS]</b>	<b>Next: 9/26/2016 4:45 PM</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Cornelis deBoer, Regular Member	
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Kristi Agniel, Regular Member	
<b>AYES:</b>	Marino, deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel	

3. **CASE 16.085, 21 JOHN STREET, Young Seamans House, 1798 (COLLEGE HILL)**  
The applicant is requesting the removal of two windows and the installation of French doors, deck and steps to the first floor, rear elevation.

Gregory L Mundy & Phyllis A Dennery, applicants/owners, and Geoff Hawley, Parker Construction, appeared before the Commission requesting the removal of two windows and the installation of French doors, deck and steps to the first floor, rear elevation.

Mr. Martin gave a staff report. 21 John Street is a structure of historical and architectural significance that contribute to the significance of the College Hill Historic Landmark District; the prominent features of the property are its 5-bay facade. The introduction of French doors and a deck to the rear of the building will have a minimal effect on the property and a negligible effect on the surrounding district.

**Historic District Commission**  
444 Westminister Street, Ste 3A , Providence, RI 02903  
Phone 401 680 8400 | Fax 401 680 8492

The Commission had the following comments: would it be possible to retain one of the windows, ideally the west corner window? Also a smaller door with simpler trim would be preferred. The applicant's responded that retaining the window and incorporating simpler trim is acceptable. Also a smaller door should be doable, but would have to be investigated further.

The Chair asked for public comment. No public comment was taken. Public comment was closed.

Motion to approve as modified, with the west corner window to be retained and simple trim to be used on the new door, with revised drawings to Staff, citing Standard 8.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>APPROVED, AS AMENDED [UNANIMOUS]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Clark Schoettle, Regular Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Catherine Lund, Regular Member
<b>AYES:</b>	Marino, deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel

**4. 30 STIMSON AVENUE (STIMSON AVENUE)**

The applicant is appearing to discuss the construction of a 1 ½ story garage to be located in the rear northwest corner of the property.

Michael Marino, applicant/owner, and Jack Renshaw, architect, appeared before the Commission requesting the construction of a 1 ½ story garage to be located in the rear northwest corner of the property.

Mr. Martin gave a staff report. 30 Stimson Avenue is a structure of historical and architectural significance that contribute to the significance of the Stimson Avenue Historic District; due to the siting of the property, the gable-end roof, and the closeness of the abutting properties the modifications as proposed will not be visible from the public right-of-way. The proposal needs a zoning variance for height. There has been an issue with scheduling zoning meetings and the item is now scheduled for the August ZBR meeting. In order to make it feasible for construction to be done by winter, the item was placed on this month's HDC agenda in order to save the applicant some time in finalizing the City's approvals for the project. The application received Conceptual Approval at Commission's September 2016 regular meeting. At this meeting the Commission recommended that the applicant explore: removing the dormer; lowering the clerestory roof-line; and using four windows closer in size to the main residence's windows instead of the proposed half-round-top windows. Messrs. Marino and Renshaw gave an update. The proposed changes have been incorporated into the final design and are reflected in the submitted drawings.

The Commission had the following comments: there was a question about the driveway: it will be pavers with grass strips; an Atlas metal roof was suggested; also some way to dress up the beam for lifting items to second floor (perhaps encase in a material to dress-up).

The Chair asked for public comment. No public comment was taken. Public comment was closed.

Motion to approve as submitted, with final details to Staff, citing Standards 8 & 9.

<b>RESULT:</b>	<b>APPROVED [6 TO 0]</b>
<b>MOVER:</b>	Cornelis deBoer, Regular Member
<b>SECONDER:</b>	Kristi Agniel, Regular Member
<b>AYES:</b>	deBoer, Schoettle, Regan, Lund, Kaplan, Agniel
<b>RECUSED:</b>	Marino

**ADJOURNMENT**